

MINUTES OF THE 125th MEETING OF THE HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE (HCC)
HELD ON 03.00 P.M. ON MONDAY, APRIL 3, 2023.

Sl. No	PROPOSAL	OBSERVATIONS /RECOMMENDATIONS	DECISION
1.	Building plans proposal for addition/alteration in respect of Plot no. 3880-3881, Old No. 2224-A, Ward no.9, Main Sarak, Pandit Prem Narayan Chooriwalan, Bazar Sitaram.	<p>1. The proposal was forwarded by the MCD (Online) for consideration of the HCC. The proposal is in the gazette notified heritage list of the MCD area Grade-III listed at serial no. 162 vide gazette notification <i>dated 29th July 2016</i> issued by the Govt. of NCT of Delhi.</p> <p>2. The proposal received from MCD (online) at the formal stage was scrutinized along with the provisions as stipulated for grade-III heritage-listed properties under Unified Building Bye Laws for Delhi 2016 (UBBL), comments from the concerned local body i.e., MCD, and the submission made, following observations are to be complied with:</p> <p>a) The office of the Chief Town Planner, MCD vide their letter no: TP/G/507/2023 dated 02.03.2023 has indicated that:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;"><i>“.....inspection report of the property under reference has been received from EE(Bldg.)-II/CSPZ vide note dated 28/02/2023 and the same is reproduced as under:</i></p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;"><i>The property consists of ground floor and first floor at front portion, rear portion of the property found demolished and a well is found noticed in the middle of the property.....”</i></p> <p>It was surprising to note that the rear portion of the heritage structure has been completely demolished and the photographs submitted clearly show a lot of heritage elements on the left-over walls.</p>	Not accepted, observations given.

		<p>b) The provisions as stipulated under clause 1.4 of annexure-II of UBBL for Delhi are as follows:</p> <p><i>“...1.4 Penalties: Violation of the regulations shall be punishable under the provisions regarding unauthorized development. In case of proved deliberate neglect of and/ or damage to Heritage Buildings and Heritage precincts, or if the building is allowed to be damaged or destroyed due to neglect or any other reason, in addition to penal action provided under the concerned Act, no permission to construct any new building shall be granted on the site if a Heritage Building or Building in a Heritage Precinct is damaged or pulled down without appropriate permission from Commissioner, MCD/Vice Chairman DDA/Chairman NDMC.</i></p> <p><i>It shall be open to the Heritage Conservation Committee to consider a request for rebuilding/reconstruction of a Heritage Building that was unauthorized demolished or damaged, provided that the <u>total built-up area in all floors put together in such new construction is not in excess of the total built-up area in all floors put together in the original Heritage Building in the same form and style in addition to other controls that may be specified...</u>”</i></p> <p>c) The Committee observed that the architect/proponent has not provided plot details, original built coverage details/built-up area, layout plan of the original built construction (<i>ground + first floor</i>), heritage elements, uncut photographs of the site from various angles to understand the heritage proposal judiciously.</p> <p>d) Taking into consideration, the above aspects including comments from the local body, and the provisions as stipulated under clause 1.4 of the annexure-II of the UBBL for Delhi 2016, the Committee suggested to prepare proposal for the heritage structure in the site as was existing earlier following the design</p>	
--	--	---	--

		<p>principles, architectural form and style, as well as façade details, revealed through the photographs and listed documentation of the erstwhile structure. The same will have to be achieved by retaining the original footprint of the heritage building, and built-up area and using similar design elements, materials, art and architecture as of the original heritage structure as per the provisions of clause 1.4 of UBBL.</p> <p>e) Materials and building components of the original heritage structure that is available at the site shall be carefully salvaged and re-used for the reconstruction to the maximum extent possible.</p> <p>f) Considering the sensitivity of the matter, in future, the concerned local body i.e., MCD was asked to examine, authenticate and verify the submitted proposal first at their end, by ensuring that the proposed detailed design scheme of the heritage structure is following the design principles, architectural form and style as well as façade details by retaining the existing footprint of the heritage building, built-up area and using similar design elements, materials, art and architecture as of the heritage structure, before forwarding the same for consideration of the HCC.</p> <p>3. In view of the insufficient information provided, the heritage proposal could not be appreciated judiciously by the Committee and returned to the concerned local body i.e., MCD with the request to examine, authenticate and verify the submitted heritage proposal first ensuring all applicable requirements indicated above including as per clause 1.4 of annexure-II of UBBL has been fulfilled before forwarding the same for consideration of the HCC.</p>	
--	--	---	--

		4. The architect is advised to adhere to the above observations of the Committee and furnish a pointwise compliance & reply.	
2.	Building plan proposal in respect of Common Central Secretariat (Building 10), at Plot no. 138, Ashoka Road.	<p>1. The proposal forwarded by the CPWD (online) was scrutinized.</p> <p>2. The proposal was scrutinized, and the following observations are given:</p> <p>a) The Committee took note of letter no: 12(01)/CA(D)/2023/101 dated 31.03.2023 issued by the Chief Architect (Delhi), the extracts are as follows:</p> <p><i>“.....1. Common Central Secretariat- 10, at plot no.-138, Ashoka Road, New Delhi does not fall in the listed heritage building and precincts. 2.Enclosed document and drawings are in sink with local building byelaws. 3. This project is being forwarded to HCC because the said plot falls near Central Vista.....”</i></p> <p>b) The proposed Common Central Secretariat (Building 10) is proposed to be constructed on plot no-138 at Ashoka Road, New Delhi which does not fall in any of the listed heritage buildings and its precincts.</p> <p>c) No heritage structure exists on plot no-138, Ashoka Road, New Delhi.</p> <p>d) The concerned local body, as indicated above at para 2, that Plot no-138 is adjoining the Central Vista precinct (Grade-1 Heritage) boundary which is listed as Grade-1.</p> <p>e) The HCC observed that the development on plot no-138 is not making any impact/ disturbing the adjoining Central Vista precinct (Grade-1 Heritage).</p>	Accepted, observations given.

		3. In view of the above observations, the proposal was found <i>acceptable.</i> ”	
3. Repair/Renovati on in respect of C-13, Ground and Mezzanine floor, Connaught Place.	<p>1. The proposal forwarded by the NDMC electronically was scrutinized. It included the <i>work in terms of plastering, POP, furniture & fixtures, flooring/re-flooring, temporary internal partitions (gypsum/wooden/glass), patchwork, painting and whitewashing, false ceiling, panelling work (gypsum), glass glazing, proposed outdoor units of AC shall be placed on the roof/terrace of the building, damaged part of the structure and all damaged heritage characters to be repaired as per defined materials/guidelines of HCC, proposed design to maintain heritage aesthetic of external façade, proposed temporary doors, temporary proposed rolling shutter.</i></p> <p>2. The proposal was scrutinized along with the comments given by the concerned local body i.e., NDMC.</p> <p>3. The Committee observed that the NDMC has forwarded the proposal for repair/renovation under clause 2.0.1(d) of the UBBL 2016 whereas a decision was taken in a meeting held between the Chief Architect, NDMC and the Member-Secretary under the Chairmanship of Chairman HCC on March 16, 2022, that:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;"><i>“.....provisions, as stipulated under clause 7.26 & Annexure-II of UBBL, are applicable to the heritage areas/properties.....”</i></p> <p>4. Taking into consideration the decision as indicated above, and in the interest of work, the Committee decided to consider the proposal under clause 7.26 & Annexure-II of Unified Building Bye Laws for Delhi 2016 (UBBL), the following observations are to be complied with:</p>	Accepted, observations given.	

		<p>a) The work in terms of repainting the Inner Circle, outer circle and radial road façade of blocks and repair work of wall plaster, Kota & marble flooring repair required whenever damaged on the existing pattern in Connaught Place shall be done by the local body i.e., NDMC as per acceptance given by the HCC at its meeting held on February 14, 2023.</p> <p>b) No changes are permitted on the external facade, which should be retained as per the original design. It should be ensured that the repair work be carried out on-site by skilled workers under the supervision of heritage professionals while upholding the originality of the structure in terms of its heritage character, construction, colour, form, materials etc.</p> <p>c) Standardisation of the materials, colour scheme, colour grade, grooves, and overall originality of each element of the existing heritage structure be ensured by the NDMC.</p> <p>d) The structural safety of the building should be ensured. All original Heritage Characters should be retained in the modifications.</p> <p>e) NDMC shall ensure that the placement, size, colour, text etc. of the signage/signboards etc. be as per approved policy/guidelines prepared by NDMC for the Connaught Place area.</p>	
Additional items			
1	Building plans in respect of	1. The proposal was forwarded by the MCD (Online) for consideration by the HCC. The proposal is in the gazette notified heritage list of the MCD area listed for	Not accepted,

<p>Residential Group Housing at plot no.7, Court Road, Civil Lines.</p>	<p>Grade-III heritage listed buildings at serial no. 8 titled (Residence) vide gazette notification no: F. 7(367)/227/2002/UD/841 dated 25th February 2010 issued by the Department of Urban Development, Govt. of NCT of Delhi.</p> <p>2. Earlier, the Heritage Conservation Committee (HCC) did not approve the proposal forwarded by the MCD (online) at its meetings held on April 06, 2022, May 24, 2022, and December 1, 2022, every time very detailed specific observations were given.</p> <p>4. The revised proposal received from MCD (online) at the formal stage was scrutinized along with the previous observations of the Committee communicated vide HCC observations letter no: 5(3)/2022-HCC-Online, OL-1905225003 dated 26.05.2022 & 5(6)/2022-HCC-Online, OL-1910225006 dated 26.10.2022 and 5(10)/2022-HCC-Online, OL-2311225010 dated 05.12.2022 respectively, and the reply of the architect dated 28.03.2023. Based on the previous observations given, replies submitted by the architect, and submission made, the following observations are to be complied with:</p> <p>a) The Committee carefully examined all its previous observations and concluded that the proposal prepared and submitted is not in the right spirit of its previous extensive observations given in the matter. Moreover, inconsistencies have been observed in the submission, the 3D views, plans, elevations, sections submitted along with the project report & the submission do not match. The proposal is at the formal stage all the drawings (<i>including plans/elevations/section/3d views etc.</i>) should match with each other. A coordinated, corrected submission shall be submitted for the consideration of HCC.</p>	<p>observations given.</p>
--	---	-----------------------------------

		<p>b) The proposal for the reconstruction of the heritage structure shall be prepared by following the design principles, architectural form and style as well as façade details revealed through the photographs and listed documentation of the erstwhile structure. The same will have to be achieved by retaining the existing footprint of the heritage building, and built-up area and using similar design elements, materials, art and architecture as of the heritage block, in the entire design scheme in terms of clause 1.4 of the annexure-II of the UBBL for Delhi. A proportionate amount of green space shall be maintained all around this structure to maintain continuity with the <i>'bungalow type'</i> that this heritage block in the Civil Lines area belonged to. This would impart a heritage character to the property and also enable preserving the inherent attributes of the original property.</p> <p>c) The Committee observed that the proposal for the reconstruction of the heritage property and the proposal for the Residential Group Housing have been clubbed together and submitted for the consideration of HCC. It was suggested to separate the two proposals and make a detailed submission for the <i>'Reconstruction of Heritage property'</i> first elucidating all the heritage processes & procedures for such type of heritage properties by retaining the existing footprint of the heritage building, built-up area and using similar design elements, materials, art and architecture as of the heritage block, in terms of the clause 1.4 of the annexure-II of the UBBL for Delhi.</p> <p>d) Considering the sensitivity of the matter, in future, the concerned local body i.e., MCD was asked to examine, authenticate and verify the submitted proposal first at their end, by ensuring that the detailed design scheme to reconstruct the heritage structure is following the design principles,</p>	
--	--	--	--

		<p>architectural form and style as well as façade details by retaining the existing footprint of the heritage building, built-up area and using similar design elements, materials, art and architecture as of the heritage structure, before forwarding the same for consideration of the HCC.</p> <p>5. In view of the inconsistencies noticed, and insufficient information provided, the heritage proposal could not be appreciated judiciously by the Committee and returned to the concerned local body i.e., MCD with the request to examine, authenticate and verify the submitted heritage proposal first ensuring all applicable requirements indicated above including as per clause 1.4 of annexure-II of UBBL has been fulfilled before forwarding the same for the consideration of the HCC.</p> <p>6. The architect is advised to adhere to the above observations of the Committee and suggested to separate the proposal for the '<i>Reconstruction of Heritage property</i>' and furnish a pointwise compliance & reply.</p>	
--	--	--	--

sd/-

(SurendraKumar Bagde)
Chairman, HCC
Additional Secretary (D),
Ministry of Housing & Urban Affairs,
Government of India.

sd/-

(Ruby Kaushal)
Member-Secretary, HCC